Bryan W. Shaw, Ph.D., P.E., Chairman Toby Baker, Commissioner Zak Covar, Commissioner Richard A. Hyde, P.E., Executive Director



TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

Protecting Texas by Reducing and Preventing Pollution

January 17, 2013

The Honorable Administrative Law Judges Sharon Cloninger and Richard A. Wilfong State Office of Administrative Hearings 300 West 15th Street, Suite 502 Austin, Texas 78701

Re: Executive Director's Reply to Exceptions to the Administrative Law Judge's Proposal for Decision, Order, and Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law for NSR Permit Registration No. 102982, TCEQ Docket No. 2013-0657-AIR; SOAH Docket No. 582-13-4611

Dear Judge Cloninger and Judge Wilfong:

Enclosed please find the Executive Director's Reply to Exceptions to the Administrative Law Judge's Proposal for Decision, Order, and Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law for the contested case hearing listed above. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact Mr. Booker Harrison at (512) 239-4113.

Sincerely,

Alexis Lorick, Staff Attorney Environmental Law Division

Enclosure

cc All parties (as indicated on the service list)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify th	at a true	and co	orrect copy	of the foregoing	ig documer	nt has been	served v	via hand	delivery,
facsimile,	electronic	filing,	electronic	mail, first class	mail, intera	agency mail	, and/or	overnigh	t mail as
indicated of	on this	<u> 17th</u>	day of _	January	, 2014,	on the attac	ched serv	rice list.	

Ms. Alexis Lorick State Bar No. 24070174 Staff Attorney, Environmental Law Division

SERVICE LIST

FOR THE STATE OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

Hon. Richard A. Wilfong & Hon. Sharon Cloninger Administrative Law Judges P.O. Box 13025 300 West 15th Street, Suite 502 Austin, Texas 78701-1649 Fax: (512) 475-4994

Via electronic filing

FOR THE OFFICE OF THE CHIEF CLERK

Ms. Bridget Bohac P.O. Box 13087 12100 Park 35 Circle, Bldg F Austin, Texas 78711 Fax: (512)239-3300 chiefclk@tceq.texas.gov Via electronic filing

FOR THE APPLICANT:

Mr. Derek L. Seal & Mr. Albert R. Axe Winstead P.C. 401 Congress, Ste 2100 Austin, Texas 78701 Tel: (512) 370-2807 Fax: (512) 370-2850 dseal@winstead.com Via electronic mail

FOR THE HEARING REOUESTORS

Mr. Gabriel Clark-Leach **Environmental Integrity Project** 1303 San Antonio St., Suite 200 Austin, Texas 78701 Tel: (512) 637-9477 Fax: (512) 584-8019 gclark-leach@environmentalintegritv.org Via electronic mail

FOR THE OPIC:

Via electronic mail

Mr. Eli Martinez Assistant Public Interest Counsel Texas Commission in Environmental Quality Office of Public Interest Counsel – MC 103 P.O. Box 13087 Austin, Texas 78711-3087 Tel: (512) 239-3974 Fax: (512) 239-6377 eli.martinez@tceq.texas.gov

SOAH DOCKET NO. 582-13-4611 TCEQ DOCKET NO. 2013-0657-AIR

APPLICATION BY	§	BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE		
EXXON MOBIL CORPORATION	§			
FOR PROPOSED AIR	· §	OF		
QUALITY PERMIT NO. 102982	§	ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS		
	§			

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPLY TO EXCEPTIONS TO THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES' PROPOSAL FOR DECISION AND ORDER

TO THE HONORABLE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES SHARON CLONINGER AND RICHARD A. WILFONG:

COMES NOW, the Executive Director of the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality (Commission or TCEQ) and files the Executive Director's Reply to Exceptions Administrative Law Judge's (ALJ) Proposal for Decision and Order, and in support thereof shows the following:

I. Reply to Exceptions

The issues raised in the exceptions by the other parties in the above-entitled matter have been sufficiently addressed in previous filings by the Executive Director; however, the Executive Director offers the following limited revisions to his previously submitted Exceptions to the PFD and observations on those submitted by the other parties:

II. The Applicant's Exceptions to the PFD

The Applicant suggests substituting the word "unrefined" in Finding of Fact 173 with "other." The Applicant also suggests including new Finding of Fact 20A based on conclusions made by the ALJs on page 22 of the PFD. Replacing "unrefined" with "other" in Finding of Fact 173 is confusing, making the entire Finding ambiguous. This revision, as well as including new Finding of Fact 22, is unnecessary for the Commission

EXXONMOBIL CORPORATION, INC.
APPLICATION FOR AIR QUALITY PERMIT NO. 102982
SOAH DOCKET NO. 582-13-4611; TCEQ DOCKET NO. 2013-0657-AIR
THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPLY TO EXCEPTIONS TO THE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW
JUDGES' PROPOSAL FOR DECISION AND ORDER
Page 2 of 2

to issue the ALJ's PFD based on the Executive Director's determination that the application for permit 102982 meets all applicable state and federal regulatory requirements.

IV. Conclusion

The Executive Director respectfully requests that the Commission include with his previously submitted revisions to the PFD and the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the forgoing corrections and issue the Proposed Order.

Respectfully submitted,

Texas Commission on Environmental Quality

Richard A. Hyde, P.E., Executive Director

Caroline Sweeney, Deputy Director Office of Legal Services

Robert Martinez, Division Director Environmental Law Division

Alexis E. Lorick, Staff Attorney Environmental Law Division State Bar No. 24070174 P.O. Box 13087, MC 173 Austin, Texas 78711-3087 (512) 239-0649

REPRESENTING THE
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE
TEXAS COMMISSION ON
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY